



# Oregon Fish and Wildlife Commission Minutes

Meeting: March 8, 2013 – 8:00 a.m.  
Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife  
Commission Room  
3406 Cherry Avenue  
Salem, Oregon 97303

1  
2 *Commission minutes are considered draft until approved by the*  
3 *Commission at its next meeting.*  
4

5 Notice of these meetings had been made by press release of statewide media  
6 circulation. Those attending part or all of the meeting included:  
7

Michael Finley, Acting Chair	Roy Elicker, Director
Bob Webber, Commissioner	Curt Melcher, Deputy Director
Holly Akenson, Commissioner	Debbie Colbert, Deputy Director
Gregory J. Wolley, Commissioner	Steve Sanders, Assistant Attorney General
Laura Anderson, Commissioner	Teri Kucera, Executive Assistant

## 8 **MEETING**

9 On Friday, March 8, 2013 at 8:00 a.m., Acting Chair Mike Finley (Chair Finley) called the  
10 Oregon Fish and Wildlife Commission (Commission) meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. He  
11 announced that Chair Bobby Levy was unable to attend the meeting today. He said the  
12 Commission would hold the Executive Session during their lunch hour.  
13

## 14 **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

### 15 **Field Reports**

#### 16 Northeast Region

17 Bruce Eddy, Region Manager, said the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) is  
18 evaluating if Washington Ground Squirrels warrant federal Endangered Species Act  
19 (ESA) listing. Threemile Farms entered into a Multi-Species Candidate Conservation  
20 Agreement with Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife (ODFW), USFWS, and The  
21 Nature Conservancy (TNC). Eddy discussed the importance of hunting access to private  
22 lands and the development of corporate farms. The Columbia Basin regulated hunt and  
23 ODFW's agreement with Boise Cascade provides almost 500,000 acres of access. He  
24 talked about youth hunts in Union and Baker Counties, and examples of staff working  
25 and assisting landowners with wildlife damage to their crops.  
26  
27

#### 28 High Desert Region

29 Chip Dale, Region Manager, said staff is looking at not opening the Deschutes spring  
30 Chinook fishery because of an expected low return of 650 wild spring Chinook to Warm  
31 Springs River; although there likely will be a Tribal fishery. He said the Deschutes fall  
32 Chinook return in 2012 was 18,785 fish; the management objective was 4,000 wild fall  
33 Chinook. Staff has targeted an escapement over Shears Fall of 2,000 fish; over 12,000  
34 passed last year. Dale said staff will open the spring Chinook fishery in the Hood River  
35 this year and predict 949 hatchery fish and 183 wild fish. The proposed 2013 Chinook  
36 season opens April 15 and closes June 30 to protect early returning fall Chinook that will

1 have no fishery this year. He said based on a predicted run of 500 fish and 1,200  
2 hatchery fish, staff expects good winter steelhead fishing this year. Dale discussed  
3 rangeland rehabilitation due to wildfires last summer. Also, staff are working with  
4 USFWS to address geese depredation on farmland in the Klamath Basin.

#### 5 6 Southwest Region

7 Larry Cooper, Region Manager, reported that Diamond Lake is open for ice fishing. Staff  
8 conducted a two-day ice-fishing clinic February 8-9 that was attended by 57 people. He  
9 said during the Umpqua Fishery Enhancement Derby that 20 teams consisting of 40  
10 guides and 80 anglers participated. Two of the four days was dedicated to youth  
11 activities. Staff collected 42 brood stock steelhead for the South Umpqua winter  
12 steelhead hatchery program, last year 30 fish were collected.

#### 13 14 Northwest Region

15 Chris Wheaton, Region Manager, said at Fern Ridge Wildlife Area, 4,202 hunter trips  
16 harvested 4,101 ducks. The Sauvie Island Wildlife Area season saw a total of 17,536  
17 birds harvested by 9,437 hunters. He said in February staff implement hazing of sea  
18 lions foraging near the Willamette Falls fish ladder. Wheaton said since February, 21  
19 Columbian White-tailed deer in Washington have been relocated to Ridgefield National  
20 Wildlife Refuge. The deer are ESA-listed and are being removed due to the risk of  
21 habitat loss due to a potential dike failure at the Julia Butler Hanson National Wildlife  
22 Refuge. The USFWS is conducting this operation with other groups.

#### 23 24 Conservation Program

25 Holly Michael, Conservation Policy Coordinator, said for 31 years, the Oregon Wildlife  
26 Heritage Foundation, now known as Oregon Wildlife, has been a strong partner. During  
27 that time they have put over \$15 million on the ground to help with species recovery and  
28 management, habitat restoration, access and other efforts. She talked about projects  
29 that Oregon Wildlife funds and its embracement of the Oregon Conservation Strategy,  
30 now used as a primary component of how they review projects and fund them. She said  
31 Oregon Wildlife also funds local county soil and water conservation districts and private  
32 landowners, which ODFW always receives benefits from.

#### 33 34 Information & Education

35 Roger Fuhrman, Administrator, distributed "*50 Places to go Fishing Within 90 Minutes of*  
36 *Bend*". Staff is working on guides for other areas. He noted that the Central Oregon  
37 Sports Show is this weekend. Staff is developing an online mobile application that will  
38 highlight fishing opportunities statewide; it should be available early next year. He  
39 discussed two recent media issues: reminder to non-motorized boaters to purchase  
40 Aquatic Invasive Species Prevention Permits and the Japanese tsunami debris washing  
41 ashore. Fuhrman said to generate more interest for the ODFW Outdoors Facebook  
42 page staff held a photo contest through January. The winning photos are available  
43 online. On Wednesday, a news release invited the public to submit photos for the ODFW  
44 website and publications.

#### 45 46 Marine Resources Program

1 Caren Braby, Program Manager, said the Oregon Pink shrimp fishery was recertified for  
2 an additional five years under the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC). In the next five  
3 years the fishery will consider additional management considerations that staff will bring  
4 before the Commission for consideration in a year or two. The Oregon commercial  
5 Dungeness crab fishery passed its second annual audit. The Oregon Legislature is  
6 considering a bill to exempt the crab fishery and derelict gear removal efforts from  
7 personal property laws. If it passes, staff and the Commission will design a program to  
8 clean up that gear. She said in February five Japanese vessels landed on Oregon's  
9 coast. Staff is working with Oregon Parks and Recreation Department, Oregon State  
10 University, and international experts to prevent the spread of invasive species. A portion  
11 of the Agate Beach dock is now on public display at the Hatfield Marine Science Center.  
12

### 13 Oregon State Police, Fish and Wildlife Division

14 Captain Jeff Samuels said Troopers out of The Dalles conducted a boat patrol on the  
15 Columbia River in the Bonneville pool; eight citations and five warnings were issued. He  
16 said Troopers approached one angler in a boat who had a retained sturgeon tied off with  
17 a rope. The Troopers noticed inside the boat containers of sand shrimp and fishing  
18 weights. The angler's line was hooked to a rope. Troopers assisted in retrieving the rope,  
19 which had a bag of sand shrimp and weights tied to the end. The angler was chumming  
20 for sturgeon and was cited for Taking Sturgeon Prohibited Method-Chumming.  
21

### 22 **Expenditure and Budget Report**

23 Debbie Colbert, Deputy Director for Administration, distributed the Financial Report and  
24 said Department-wide, expenditures are within budgeted projections within the biennium.  
25 Revenues lag because we operate on a reimbursement basis doing contract and grant  
26 work; the revenues catch up as staff closes out the biennium. She said the 2013-2015  
27 Governor's budget is posted at: [http://www.dfw.state.or.us/agency/budget/2013-](http://www.dfw.state.or.us/agency/budget/2013-15_budget_development.asp)  
28 [15\\_budget\\_development.asp](http://www.dfw.state.or.us/agency/budget/2013-15_budget_development.asp). ODFW is scheduled to present before the Ways and  
29 Means Natural Resources Subcommittee on April 8, 9, and 10; public comment will be  
30 taken April 11. Director Elicker, Deputy Director Curt Melcher, and she have met with the  
31 subcommittee members on budget matters. Deputy Director Colbert said a number of  
32 internal committees are working to prepare for the move to the new Salem  
33 Headquarters. The Oregon State Treasurer sold the bonds recently at a rate that will  
34 benefit ODFW.  
35

### 36 **Adopt Temporary Rules**

37 Director Roy Elicker asked the Commission to adopt 11 temporary rules on pages 1-3 of  
38 the tan-colored agenda starting with OAR 635-053-0035 on page 1 through OAR 635-  
39 041-0045 and 635-041-0065 on page 3.  
40

#### 41 **1. 635-053-0035**

##### 42 **Wild Turkey**

43 Adopted January 23, 2013: effective dates January 23, 2013 through July 13, 2013.  
44 This amendment removes the minimum shot size requirement for hunting wild turkeys.  
45 Ammunition manufacturers have developed various alloys used to make shot that are  
46 very dense with superior downrange ballistics making them an effective turkey load in  
47 the smaller shot sizes, (e.g. less than #6 shot). Turkey hunters target the head and

1 neck of the bird and choose ammunition that is most effective at delivering a dense  
2 pattern ensuring multiple hits with sufficient energy.

3  
4 **2. 635-042-0135**

5 **Columbia River Commercial Sturgeon Seasons below Bonneville Dam Set for**  
6 **January and February 2013**

7 Adopted January 30, 2013: effective January 31, 2013 through February 28, 2013.

8 This amended rule implements winter commercial white sturgeon seasons in the  
9 Columbia River below Bonneville Dam using drift gill nets. The fishing periods  
10 authorized are: 6:00 p.m., Thursday, January 31 through 6:00 p.m., Friday, February 1  
11 (24 hours); 6:00 p.m., Monday, February 4 through 6:00 p.m., Tuesday, February 5 (24  
12 hours); and 6:00 p.m., Wednesday, February 6 through 6:00 p.m., Thursday, February 7,  
13 2013 (24 hours).

14  
15 **3. 635-042-0145, 635-042-0160, 635-042-0170 and 635-042-0180**

16 **2013 Commercial Winter-Summer Fisheries for Columbia River Select Areas**

17 Adopted January 30, 2013: effective February 11, 2013 through July 31, 2013.

18 Amended rules set seasons, area boundaries, gear regulations and allowable sales for  
19 winter, spring and summer commercial fisheries in the Columbia River Select Areas.  
20 Modifications are consistent with the action taken January 30, 2013 by the Columbia  
21 River Compact agencies of the states of Oregon and Washington.

22  
23 **4. 635-017-0095**

24 **Willamette Zone Recreational White Sturgeon Fishery Modifications**

25 Adopted January 30, 2013: effective February 14, 2013 through July 31, 2013.

26 This amended rule delays the opening scheduled for February 17 by permanent rule of  
27 the recreational white sturgeon fishery in the Willamette River below the Falls, including  
28 Multnomah Channel and the Gilbert River until July 11, 2013. The fishery is open to the  
29 retention of white sturgeon with a fork length of 38 to 54 inches on Thursday, Friday, and  
30 Saturday during the periods from July 11-13 and July 18-20, 2013 or until the harvest  
31 guideline of 1,733 fish is met. The rule also clarifies that the Sandy River is closed to  
32 sturgeon retention. Revisions are consistent with action taken January 30, 2013 by the  
33 State of Oregon.

34  
35 **5. 635-023-0095 and 635-023-0125**

36 **Columbia River Recreational Sturgeon and Spring Chinook Seasons Modified**

37 Adopted January 30, 2013: effective February 28, 2013 through July 31, 2013.

38 These amended rules set 2013 Columbia River recreational spring Chinook season  
39 regulations with descriptions of areas, dates, and bag limits for recreational harvest of  
40 adipose fin-clipped Chinook salmon and adipose fin-clipped steelhead. Additional  
41 modifications establish 2013 retention fisheries for white sturgeon. Revisions are  
42 consistent with action taken January 30, 2013 by Columbia River Compact agencies of  
43 the states of Oregon and Washington.

44  
45 **6. 635-041-0045**

46 **Treaty Indian Platform Sales Allowed in Columbia River**

47 Adopted January 31, 2013: effective February 1, 2013 through March 31, 2013.

1 Amended rules allow sales of fish, except white sturgeon, landed in Treaty platform and  
2 hook and line fisheries downstream of Bonneville Dam whenever sales are allowed in  
3 Zone 6 platform and hook-and-line fisheries beginning Friday, February 1, 2013.  
4 Modifications are needed to maintain consistency with Treaty Indian and Washington  
5 State rules which currently allow platform sales. Modifications are consistent with action  
6 taken January 31, 2013 by the State of Oregon in cooperation with the State of  
7 Washington and the Columbia River Treaty Tribes.

8  
9 **7. 635-041-0065**

10 **Treaty Indian Winter Commercial Fisheries in the Columbia River above Bonneville**  
11 **Dam**

12 Adopted January 31, 2013: effective February 1, 2013 through March 31, 2013.

13 This amended rule clarifies allowable sales of fish caught in Treaty winter commercial  
14 fisheries in the Columbia River above Bonneville Dam. Allowable sales include: salmon,  
15 steelhead, shad, carp, catfish, walleye, bass and yellow perch. White sturgeon between  
16 38 to 54 inches in fork length caught in the Bonneville Pool and white sturgeon between  
17 43 to 54 inches in fork length caught in The Dalles and John Day pools may be sold or  
18 kept for subsistence use.

19  
20 **8. 635-041-0065**

21 **Treaty Indian Winter Commercial Fisheries in the John Day Pool Close**  
22 **February 27**

23 Adopted February 21, 2013: effective February 27, 2013 through June 15, 2013.

24 This amended rule closes allowable sales of fish caught in the Treaty winter commercial  
25 gillnet fishery in the John Day Pool effective at 6:00 p.m., Wednesday, February 27,  
26 2013. White sturgeon between 38 to 54 inches in fork length caught in the John Day  
27 Pool may still be retained for subsistence purposes.

28  
29 **9. 635-018-0090**

30 **2013 Spring Chinook Season on the Hood River**

31 Adopted February 25, 2013: effective April 15, 2013 through June 30, 2013.

32 Amended rule allows the sport harvest of adipose fin-clipped spring Chinook salmon in  
33 the Hood River from April 15 through June 30, 2013. The Hood River open area extends  
34 from the mouth to mainstem confluence with the East Fork; and the West Fork from the  
35 confluence with the mainstem upstream to the angling deadline 200 feet downstream of  
36 Punchbowl Falls. The daily bag limit is 2 adult adipose fin-clipped Chinook salmon per  
37 day and 5 adipose fin-clipped jack salmon per day. All salmon that have not been  
38 adipose fin-clipped must be released unharmed. All other limits and restrictions remain  
39 unchanged from those listed in the *2013 Oregon Sport Fishing Regulations* for Hood  
40 River.

41  
42 **10. 635-017-0095**

43 **Sandy River Closes to Angling for Sturgeon February 28, 2013**

44 Adopted February 27, 2013: effective February 28, 2013 through July 31, 2013.

45 This amended rule prohibits angling for, including catch-and-release, white sturgeon in  
46 the Sandy River of the Willamette Zone. Revisions are consistent with action taken  
47 February 26, 2013 by the State of Oregon.

1  
2 **11. 635-041-0045 and 635-041-0065**

3 **Treaty Indian Winter Commercial Fisheries in the Bonneville Pool Close March 6**

4 Adopted March 5, 2013: effective March 6, 2013 through June 15, 2013.

5 These amended rules close allowable sales of fish caught in the Treaty winter  
6 commercial gillnet fishery in the Bonneville Pool and Chinook sales in all treaty mainstem  
7 fisheries effective at 6:00 p.m., Wednesday, March 6, 2013. White sturgeon between 38  
8 to 54 inches in fork length caught in the Bonneville Pool may still be retained for  
9 subsistence purposes.

10  
11 Commissioner Webber referred to page 1, **OAR 635-042-0135 – Columbia River**  
12 **Commercial Sturgeon Seasons below Bonneville Dam set for January and**  
13 **February 2013**, and asked if there are limits to the commercial sturgeon. Are they  
14 seasons that run just for specific dates or are there quotas? Director Elicker said there  
15 are quotas on the sturgeon fishery; when they are reached the fishing is over.

16  
17 *Action: Commissioner Webber moved to approve the 11 administrative temporary*  
18 *set out in the agenda items 1 through 11. Commissioner Akenson seconded the*  
19 *motion, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of five.*

20  
21 **PUBLIC FORUM**

22 Director Elicker said this part of the agenda is topics and issues by the public that is not  
23 part of today's Commission agenda. Participants generally need to contact the Director's  
24 Office at least 24-hours in advance of the Commission meeting for potential participation.  
25 In this part of the Commission meeting the participant's testimony will be limited to five  
26 minutes and the Commission is unable to take any immediate action on subjects brought  
27 forward today. Director Elicker said three people signed up for the Public Forum today.

28  
29 **PUBLIC FORUM:**

Mike Dykzeul N/A	Mike Dykzeul, Oregon Forest Industries Council (OFIC), distributed, <i>2013 OFIC Annual Deer &amp; Elk Damage Survey Results</i> , a voluntary survey from OFIC foresters (see page 2). He said fire seasons continue to encroach farther into hunting seasons which increases the landowner's risk of wildfire. Last year fire risks were high due to drought conditions. He discussed a wildfire settlement in California where a judge ruled that Sierra Pacific was liable for fire caused whether by recreating public or one of their operations. A number of OFIC members closed their lands to public access because of the liability. OFIC has initiated HB 3201 and SB 709 to identify fixes so members can circumvent this type of event from happening in the future. Dykzeul said meth labs, marijuana grows, illegal dumping, or cutting gates on private land to sell as scrap metal can jeopardize public access to private land. He is meeting with ODFW next week to look for opportunities to find common ground. He said on the back page of his testimony is an
---------------------	--

	<p>anecdotal story from Bill Marshall with Cascade Timber Consulting. Dykzeul offered to coordinate a meeting between Commissioners and member foresters in their area. Commissioner Wolley expressed interest in such a tour.</p>
<p>Greg Osburn Portland, Oregon</p>	<p>Greg Osburn said he represented public in east Multnomah County, and with CCA, northwest steelheaders and local businesses concerned with practices at Cedar Creek Hatchery. The spring Chinook planting is going to be changed and stocked into Bull Run River; it will limit access and opportunity for catch of hatchery raised spring Chinook. He said ODFW's goal is to limit stray rates into the upper basin and enhance opportunity for fishing and hunting throughout the state, this would be counter to that.</p> <p>Osburn said the Native Fish Society (NFS) has filed lawsuits against the fish hatchery to change their practice; they claim that we are in violation of the ESA by the methods the "fishing game department" has implemented to enhance the runs and not have a negative effect on what they assume are native spring Chinook. He said through information from Steve Kramer of Oregon Fisheries Science it is hard to prove that there is an actual native spring Chinook run left on the Sandy. He distributed handouts. See <i>OregonLive Articles</i>. He referred to underlined text in <i>Draft Sandy Subbasin Summary, May 17, 2002, Prepared for the Northwest Power Planning Council</i> and said hatchery programs have existed on the river since the 1890's. When Marmot Dam was constructed on Sandy River in 1912, numerous downstream migrations were lost to Roslyn Lake. Osburn said on page 3 they claim that the Clackamas River and Willamette stock spring Chinook make up the majority of fish left in the basin, and those are non-native to the river. On page 4 it states "It is believed that most spring Chinook returning to the Sandy River originate from hatchery releases or are the progeny of naturally producing hatchery fish in the basin." He asked for support to see real time genetic testing in conjunction with NFS's lawsuits to support their lawsuit that we have native spring Chinook on the Sandy River.</p> <p>Osburn said NFS is headed by Bill Bakke, who has no fisheries science background. Osburn is concerned that ODFW and Todd Alsbury consider his word sacred. NFS is backed by McKenzie Flyfishers. In an interview with Bakke, he told Osburn he would like to see the Sandy River turned into a fly fishing only, catch and release stream. Osburn</p>

	<p>said 95% of the fishermen that use the stream are not fly fishermen. He is concerned for the youth in the area that can't fly fish, for the local economy, and eventually that means less revenue for ODFW.</p>
<p>Al Gann Warrenton, Oregon</p>	<p>Al Gann has been in commercial fisheries for 57 years. He distributed written testimony from Coalition of Coastal Fisheries (CCF) representing charter and commercial fishing, thousands of family wage jobs, and community organizations along the Oregon and Washington coast in support of the Columbia River (CR) commercial gillnet fishery's legal challenge of the current rule-making process regarding the Kitzhaber Plan. Their concerns are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What does the future hold for other fisheries and dependent communities given an entire fishery is being eliminated from the CR mainstem and limited to small back-channel areas.</li> <li>• No compensation for losses before economic studies had been done and thorough scientific study of impacts on ESA-listed species completed.</li> <li>• The Commission's role does not mean "rubber stamping" the wishes of Governor Kitzhaber.</li> <li>• Resource allocation grab affects CR communities and Oregonians not able to catch CR salmon.</li> <li>• These decisions strike at sound natural resources decisions throughout the state. What fishery or seafood industry will fall next?</li> <li>• In 2012, the people defeated Ballot Measure 81, yet the resource re-allocation continued.</li> </ul> <p>Gann said CCF members are concerned about the actions of both Oregon and Washington's Commissioners. They hope the Commission's future decisions can reinstall their confidence in the Commission process.</p>

- 1  
2 **Exhibit A: COMMISSION MINUTES**  
3 Chair Finley asked to the Commission for any edits to the draft September 7, October 5,  
4 November 9, December 6 and 7, 2012, and January 11, 2013 minutes. The following  
5 edits were made to the draft minutes:  
6 • September 7 minutes, page 9, line 4. Change "If we quit putting ~~this habit~~ fish in..."  
7 to read "If we quit putting **these** fish in...".  
8 • November 9, page 1, insert "**Michael Finley, Vice-Chair**" as an attendee.  
9 • December 6-7, 2012 and January 11, 2013, page 1, change Michael Finley's title  
10 from Commissioner to "**Vice-Chair**".



- 1 • December 7, page 64, line 9, change the phrase "...hasn't been addressed of  
2 ~~where~~ they're going..." to "...hasn't been addressed **or how** they're going..."
- 3 • December 7, page 80, line 14, change "Commissioners ~~Akenson~~ and Wolley said  
4 no.' to read "Commissioners **Anderson** and Wolley said no."

5  
6 *Action: Commissioner Webber moved to approve the draft September 7, October*  
7 *5, November 9, December 6 and 7, 2012, and January 11, 2013 minutes as*  
8 *amended. Commissioner Wolley seconded the motion and the motion carried*  
9 *unanimously by a vote of five.*

## 10 11 **Exhibit B: ACCESS AND HABITAT PROJECT FUNDING**

12 Matt Keenan, Access and Habitat (A&H) Program Coordinator, said the Bighorn Sheep  
13 auction tag sold for a record \$135,000. The Governor's Combination Statewide Deer and  
14 Elk tag sold for a record \$48,000. He presented three recommended projects:

- 15  
16 1. *2013-02 Hancock Forest Management.* Funds would hire an ODFW technician to  
17 patrol 158,000 acres of private timberland on five Travel Management Areas. In  
18 return, the landowner would allow continued public hunting access to 292,000  
19 acres.
- 20  
21 2. *2013-03 Fur Mountain.* Would provide public access to 120 acres of landlocked  
22 public land for 2,724 acres for one year. He said the project originally proposed to  
23 provide access for three years but the A&H Board asked for information on hunter  
24 use and satisfaction before it makes long-term funding commitments. ODFW will  
25 gather that data for the A&H Board.
- 26  
27 3. *2013-04 Prairie Springs Wildlife Watering.* Habitat project would seed 48 acres  
28 with dry-land alfalfa and install a water trough for wildlife; 500 acres impacted.

29  
30 Keenan said these projects would provide public hunting access on 294,724 acres of  
31 private land, and 500 acres of habitat would be improved. Total project cost is \$325,275  
32 of which \$165,345 comes from match funds. The total A&H funding request is \$159,930.  
33 Staff recommends approval of A&H Board's recommendations for project funding.

34  
35 **Public Testimony:** There was no public testimony.

36  
37 *Action: Commissioner Holly Akenson moved to approve the recommendations of*  
38 *the Access and Habitat Board for project funding as listed in Attachment 1 and*  
39 *Attachment 2. Commissioner Laura Anderson seconded the motion and the*  
40 *motion carried unanimously by a vote of five.*

## 41 42 **Exhibit C: WOLF UPDATE**

43 Russ Morgan, Wolf Coordinator, provided an annual summary of ODFW's Wolf Plan for  
44 2012 during a slide presentation.

45  
46 *Wolf population.* There are six known wolf packs in northeastern (NE) Oregon and six  
47 breeding pairs. Morgan said in the Commission's packet it states seven packs. Last

1 week staff received genetic information that the Upper Minam and Minam River packs  
2 were in fact genetically the same pack. Staff documented 22 pups in 2012. In December  
3 the wolf count was 46 wolves. The Wolf Plan calls for a conservation objective of four  
4 breeding pairs for three consecutive years. 2012 is the first year so by December 2014  
5 we could meet that objective

6  
7 *Capture and Monitoring.* Staff monitored 10 wolves and attached six new GPS collars  
8 and one VHF collar. GPS collars are more costly but provide infinitely more information.  
9 GPS collar failures continue to be a problem, but each year the collars do get better. The  
10 younger animals disperse and staff loses contact. Morgan gave an update on the  
11 movement of OR 11, OR 16, and OR 10 along the Oregon-Washington borders.

12  
13 *Depredation.* Morgan said staff conducted 36 wolf depredation investigations in five  
14 counties; 26 occurred in Wallowa County. The number of incidents declined; a result of  
15 fewer cattle depredations attributed to the Imnaha Pack. There were 8 incidences of  
16 confirmed depredation. The area of depredation spread to Baker and Umatilla Counties.  
17 Non-lethal measures were implemented in Wallowa County by ODFW and livestock  
18 producers. Private landowners are removing bone piles or carcasses. Last year 27  
19 Caught-in-the-Act permits were issued; 20 in Wallowa County. Last May a new online  
20 system started notifying 86 livestock producers when wolves were in their area.

21  
22 *Compensation.* House Bill 3560 (2012) created the Wolf Depredation Compensation  
23 and Financial Assistance County Block Grant Program administered by Oregon  
24 Department of Agriculture. It authorizes counties to apply for county-based grants for  
25 compensation. Eight counties received funds in 2012. ODFW's role is to: 1) confirm wolf  
26 depredation to determine level of compensation; and 2) provide counties with map of  
27 known wolf activity so producers can apply for non-lethal measures, compensation for  
28 missing livestock or depredation, and program implementation costs.

29  
30 *Incidental and Illegal Take.* One incidental capture occurred when a USDA-APHIS  
31 Wildlife Services agent trapped and radio-collared a wolf. Morgan said last week a legal  
32 trapper caught a wolf and contacted ODFW. Staff was able to collar and release that wolf  
33 in very good health. He said one wolf had been shot and was found dead in March 2012  
34 near Cove; that investigation continues and no arrest has been made.

35  
36 *Wolf Research.* Staff looked at 141 research papers conducted by other states, in the  
37 Northern Rocky Mountains, and worldwide to assess what we know and its applicability  
38 to Oregon. NE Oregon has a different prey composition than most places in the  
39 Northern Rocky Mountains. Those differences warrant looking at wolves in Oregon  
40 opposed to relying on data from other states. Morgan said staff synthesized those  
41 findings down into three lines of research:

- 42 1. Predation rates and prey selection in areas with variable prey availability.
- 43 2. Cougar population and habitat changes in response to wolves.
- 44 3. Elk population and habitat changes in response to wolves.

1 *Next Steps.* Morgan said staff research entails developing proposals and looking for  
2 funding partners including non-funding partners, e.g., private landowners to get private  
3 land access. Staff's goal is get some of this research implemented as early as this year.  
4

5 **Public Testimony:**

<p>Bill Kelly Oregon City, Oregon</p>	<p>Bill Kelly distributed a handout, <i>Potential Wolf Control Actions in Lolo Zone</i>, and asked: <i>Who is managing Oregon's wolves and who should be giving us answers to these questions outside of these meetings?</i> ODFW has a Facebook page. He said every time a question regarding the wolf is asked it goes ignored. On the Oregon Wild website you can read, "Once the easy option of killing wolves is taken off the table we've seen reluctant but responsible ranchers stepping up said Rob Klavins, the advocacy group for Oregon Wild. Conflict is going down and rural recovery has gotten back on track."</p> <p>Before wolves were introduced to Idaho and Yellowstone it was said the wolf would not have social impact on current social and economic lifestyles and ranching. Oregon's Wolf Plan states that once federally delisted wolves are involved in chronic depredation, they may be killed by ODFW or Wildlife Services. Nonlethal methods will be employed first in appropriate circumstances. He said it has been four years; as the protection of livestock fell into place nonlethal deterrents failed. The Imnaha Pack moved to a different location away from ranchers last year. <i>Why can one pack of wolves be setting an example for Oregon to prove to other states such as Idaho that has 101 confirmed packs?</i></p> <p>Kelly said Oregon thinks it can be a role model for other states who have had wolves for years. Did any ODFW staff travel to Washington to listen to Mike Jimenez or Carter Neimeyer when Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife held a symposium in January? Kelly did. Carter said wolves causing livestock depredation need to be removed as soon as possible. He said Oregon reviews its Plan every five years but Idaho, Montana, and Wyoming review their plan every year. Our wolf population has nearly doubled this year. <i>Is it wise to wait until 2015 to review the Plan again?</i></p>
---	--

6  
7 Commissioner Akenson said there have been many problems with compensation and  
8 livestock killed by wolves. Is there any interest in doing research on the wolf-livestock  
9 interactions; particularly, the Imnaha pack and if we can learn anything to prevent those  
10 depredations? Morgan said that line of research is a possibility; the Imnaha Pack may

1 be a good one to look at for the reasons she suggests. Commissioner Akenson lives in  
2 Wallowa County. She said that is the most important research question that is the most  
3 ready to be researched. Staff has more time to get started on on predator/predator and  
4 predator/prey research because those affects have not yet been seen relative to the  
5 current situation we have with the depredation of livestock. She added that staff has  
6 done a great job working with local people last year. She has seen a big change in the  
7 open communication and results in her community.  
8

#### 9 **Exhibit D: OREGON ENDANGERED SPECIES ACT**

10 Martin Nugent, Threatened, Endangered and Sensitive Species Coordinator, said the  
11 Commission is required to periodically review the status of each species listed as  
12 threatened and endangered under the Oregon Endangered Species Act (OESA) to  
13 determine whether verifiable science information exists to justify the reclassification or  
14 removal of species from the list. He said there are 22 listed species. Species become  
15 listed either by State-listing or addition by petition and through rulemaking. The others  
16 are grandfathered species that were on the federal list in May 1987.

- 17 • Reptiles. All turtles are pelagic and rarely occur in ocean off Oregon. Under the  
18 federal ESA all those species are endangered. No change is recommended.
- 19 • Birds. Under OSEA three species are threatened and three are endangered. The  
20 Western Snowy Plover is listed statewide under OSEA but only the western  
21 Oregon coast population is federally listed. More brown pelican have been seen  
22 along the Oregon coast. They are protected under the federal Migratory Bird  
23 Treaty Act. Even though federally delisted and listed as endangered under OSEA  
24 staff is looking for mechanisms to remove the brown pelican from OSEA.
- 25 • Mammals. There are 12 listed mammals. Whales are grandfathered to state lists  
26 and managed by NFMS under federal ESA and Marine Mammal Protection Act.  
27 The grey whale was delisted by NMFS in 1994. Staff recommends no change.
- 28 • Other Mammals. Staff recommends no change to listed status.  
29

30 Nugent said two grandfathered species, Gray Whale and Brown Pelican, have recovered  
31 at the federal level. The current rules for OSEA do not allow delisting of species that are  
32 only migrants to or through the state and do not breed here. Staff will return to the  
33 Commission to find ways of removing them from OSEA. He said other changes are  
34 regarding taxonomy of three listed species for future rulemaking, modifying scientific  
35 names to commonly accepted taxonomic nomenclature. Scientific convention has  
36 changed the genus of the Western Ground Squirrel and Western Snowy Plover.  
37

38 **Public Testimony:** There was no public testimony.  
39

40 Chair Finley asked the Commission if they were comfortable with the Department moving  
41 forward to find mechanisms for the state to delist the Gray Whale and the Brown Pelican  
42 that have been federally delisted and to have staff come back before the Commission.  
43

44 Commissioner Webber asked if the fix is administrative. Legal Counsel Steve Sanders  
45 said staff is not certain what the fix might be. He suggested:

- 46 1. The Department of Justice originally gave advice about grandfathered species. It  
47 is conceivable that by revisiting that advice we might be able to conclude, for

1 example, that once the grandfathering event goes away it retroactively undoes the  
2 grandfathering. He said the problem with that interpretation is that was not what  
3 we used when we went to get the Semidi Island Canada goose delisted. So, it  
4 would be taking a different tactic then we did then.

- 5 2. Administratively by rule change or adjust definitions to fit within a little exception.
- 6 3. Go to the Legislature, as we did before, to ask for either something specific to  
7 these two species or perhaps more broadly to authorize the Commission to  
8 remove species that were either federally grandfathered but only infrequently  
9 found in Oregon as a generic matter, or even something more broadly. For  
10 example, authorizing the Commission to look at the entire range of the species  
11 and determining whether the standards are met.

12  
13 *Chair Finley polled the Commission and Commissioners Wolley, Anderson, Webber, and*  
14 *Akenson approved moving forward. Chair Finley said he was comfortable with letting the*  
15 *Department find the right mechanisms and to come back before the Commission. He*  
16 *said for the record the Commission has consensus from all its Commissioners to revisit*  
17 *this issue and is comfortable with revisiting it as described.*

18  
19 Director Elicker referred to the agenda and said the Commission would enter Executive  
20 Session during their lunch to discuss four major litigation topics.

## 21 22 **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

23 Chair Finley said the Oregon Fish and Wildlife Commission will now meet in executive  
24 session for the purpose of conducting deliberations related to real property transactions.  
25 The Executive Session is held pursuant to ORS 192.660 (2)(e) and (2)(h), which allows  
26 the Commission to meet in executive session to consult with legal counsel with respect  
27 to litigation filed against the Commission. Representatives of the news media and  
28 designated staff shall be allowed to attend the executive session. All other members of  
29 the audience are asked to leave the room. Representatives of the news media are  
30 specifically directed not to report on any of the deliberations during the executive  
31 session, except to state the general subject of the session as previously announced. No  
32 decision may be made in executive session. At the end of the executive session we will  
33 return to open the public meeting and welcome the audience back to hear me adjourn  
34 this public meeting.

35  
36 Chair Finley reopened the public meeting at 2:05 pm. He said the Commission did not  
37 discuss any real estate transactions only legal updates on litigation.

38  
39 Commissioner Akenson said she was part of a group of five that judged 16 art entries in  
40 the Upland Game Bird Art Contest. The winner is Sarah Stack of North Bend, Oregon  
41 who moved to Oregon in 2010 from Minnesota. Her previous wins include the 2007  
42 Minnesota duck stamp competition and Oregon's first Habitat Conservation Stamp  
43 contest in 2012 – the Western Meadow Lark on the stamp from last year.

## 44 45 **Exhibit E: DEER CREEK TRACT/SOUTH BASIN SPRINGS LAND EXCHANGE AT** 46 **PHILLIP W. SCHNEIDER WILDLIFE AREA**

1 Kevin Blakely, John Day Watershed District Manager, said the Phillip W. Schneider  
 2 Wildlife Area (PWSWA) was established in 1972 to protect winter habitat for mule deer.  
 3 In 2009, Don Moss, a local landowner and partner in S Bar S Ranches, contacted ODFW  
 4 to propose trading property adjacent to PWSWA for cash and 160-acres within PWSWA.  
 5 ODFW asked Rocky Mountain Elk Foundation (RMEF) to help facilitate the transaction.  
 6 Bill Richardson, RMEF Oregon Lands Program Manager, has coordinated the details.

7  
 8 ODFW will acquire a 560-acre parcel appraised at \$448,000 from S Bar S Ranches that  
 9 is within critical winter range for Murderers Creek and Ochoco mule deer herds. In  
 10 exchange, ODFW will transfer an isolated 160-acre tract appraised at \$123,667 to S Bar  
 11 S Ranches that has a harvestable stand of timber and juniper woodlands. The exchange  
 12 will involve some payment to S Bar S Ranches for the 560-acre parcel. There was a  
 13 concern regarding future access across the Deer Creek Tract that includes a portion of  
 14 U.S. Forest Road 24 across the northwest corner with BLM land on both sides. Blakely  
 15 said the title report clarified that U.S. Forest Road 24 is a public roadway, so public  
 16 access across the tract to public lands would not be changed with this exchange.

17  
 18 Blakely said the Public Lands Advisory Committee approved the exchange in January. A  
 19 public meeting was held February 14 in John Day. Staff has also been in contact with the  
 20 Grant County Judge. ODFW does pay annual fees to Grant County in lieu of taxes and  
 21 there is no loss of revenue due to the ownership change. ODFW also pays twice the fire  
 22 protection assessment to Department of Forestry that private landowners pay.

23  
 24 **Public Testimony:**

<p>Bill Richardson          Philomath, Oregon</p>	<p>Bill Richardson, Lands Program Manager for Oregon-Washington Rocky Mountain Elk Foundation, distributed written testimony and thanked the Commission for this opportunity. He said since 1986, RMEF has completed 724 projects on 725,721 acres, including 45,000 acres of permanent land protection. All were accomplished with the collaboration of ODFW. He talked about the Murderer's Creek acquisition in 1997 and the Glass Hill Winter Range in 2000. Richardson said this project further utilizes RMEF's donation as match for the Pittman-Robertson funding that will complete the South Basin Springs acquisition. RMEF strongly supports this land acquisition and exchange. ODFW ownership of the parcel will prevent residential/recreational amenity development there and ensure its value as important winter range for elk and mule deer. It will also provide access.</p>
<p>Al Elkins          Wilsonville, Oregon</p>	<p>Al Elkins, Oregon Hunters Association (OHA), said OHA supports this land exchange and thanks Mr. Richardson and ODFW for their work. He said in the Commission's packet is an email dated February 14, 2013, from John Crafton, Redmond OHA Board Member and Project Chairman, who had some questions about the exchange.</p>

	Elkins said those have been resolved; Crafton emailed him on March 3 and said, “we have it all covered; the exchange is good; the access will be the same and the wildlife will benefit. We are in support of the exchange.” Crafton said he had talked to ODFW and RMEF, who are brokers in the deal, and all is good. Elkins thanked the Commission.
--	--

1  
2 Commissioner Wolley asked about the additional payment to S Bar S Ranches. Blakely  
3 said it is roughly \$300,000-plus and the difference in appraised values for the 560-acre  
4 and 160-acre parcels along with the title and appraisal fees, and shared costs.

5  
6 Commissioner Webber said is that money from ODFW or is RMEF paying \$300,000?  
7 Blakely said Richardson had talked about Pittman-Robertson funding that would be part  
8 of the transaction. Commissioner Webber said is that money we have or something we  
9 will get in the future? Blakely said those are federal grant monies that come to ODFW.

10  
11 Eric Rickerson, Wildlife Division Deputy Administrator, said staff was expecting an  
12 increase of 20% to 30% increase in the Pittman-Robertson allocation from USFWS. Staff  
13 intends to use that increase for these one-time purchases. Commissioner Webber said if  
14 the Commission approves this then do we wait to get the funding? Rickerson said yes.  
15 Staff would put together a grant package and submit it as part of the normal Pittman-  
16 Robertson grant process; that new funding cycle is July 1, 2013.

17  
18 *Action: Commissioner Akenson moved to approve the exchange of described*  
19 *ODFW-owned Deer Creek Tract at Schneider Wildlife Area for described South*  
20 *Basin Springs private lands adjacent to the wildlife area and direct staff to proceed*  
21 *to escrow closing upon completion of the due diligence processes required under*  
22 *Oregon Administrative Rules for land exchanges. Commissioner Webber*  
23 *seconded the motion, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of five.*

24  
25 **Exhibit F: FISH PASSAGE BARRIER PRIORITIZATION LIST AND PRIORITY**  
26 **UNSCREENED DIVERSION INVENTORY**

27 Pete Baki, Fish Screening Coordinator, briefed the Commission on the 2013 Priority  
28 Unscreened Diversion Inventory. He discussed types of fish screens and said in 1989,  
29 the Oregon Legislature passed a bill requiring ODFW to identify areas and look for  
30 potential screening projects. Staff produced *An Inventory of Water Diversions in Oregon*  
31 *Needed Fish Screens* (December 1990) and is doing inventory to update that report.  
32 Staff obtained a database from Oregon Water Resources Department of every legal  
33 point of diversion in Oregon. There are over 50,000 water rights and each can have  
34 more than one point of division; there are over 82,000 points of diversion. Staff used a  
35 Geographical Information System (GIS) approach to create an initial list. He talked about  
36 statutory criteria that provide direction and said staff used other criteria that the Fish  
37 Screening Task Force considered appropriate. Baki said in Oregon there are 3,500  
38 priority unscreened diversions. Staff plans to use the list for outreach. For qualified  
39 projects the Fish Screening Cost Share Program provides 60% up to \$75,000, and a tax  
40 credit of 50% for the cost of screen up to \$5,000. By statute staff needs to hit 150

1 screens or 150 cfs every biennium. For the 2011-2013 biennium, staff completed 119  
2 screens through February at 230 CFS but will reach 150 easily.

3  
4 Ken Loffink, Assistant Fish Passage Coordinator for Fish Screens and Passage  
5 Program, presented the 2013 Fish Passage Priority List, which is updated every five  
6 years. The 2007 Priority List contained 67 high priority artificial obstructions. Of those  
7 17-plus were either removed or had fish passage provided there. Loffink talked about the  
8 scope of fish passage statewide. Staff used GIS and approached organizations with  
9 barrier data or inventory to create a comprehensive barrier database statewide. He said  
10 artificial obstructions are any man-made infrastructures such as culverts or dams. There  
11 are 27,800 statewide that are 17% passable, 19% partial barriers, 21% blocked, and  
12 43% is unknown because there is not enough data to quantify fish passage. To date  
13 there are there are 12,368 passage barriers. There are a lot of problems and staff really  
14 needs to prioritize how we restore fish passage.

15  
16 Loffink said staff took barrier data and sent out maps to 18 district fish biologists and  
17 asked for their top 25 fish passage barriers. Then staff used the GIS program and looked  
18 at those 25 barriers and others to figure out how much native fish habitat is upstream of  
19 these sites. Staff quantified that by species and developed a model based on the needs  
20 of native fish and available data. The model took into account different biological  
21 parameters to develop a priority ranking for each site. Staff also worked with the Fish  
22 Passage Task Force. Staff identified:

- 23 • 534 priority barriers separated into 16 groups versus ranking them 1 through 534  
24 due to habitat variability. Because there are a lot barriers staff did not want to say  
25 one barrier had .5 points more than another; therefore it is a higher priority.  
26 Barriers were put in like groups. The top group is "Top Ten". Every barrier within  
27 the Top Ten is the same priority; likewise with the next group - Group 1.
- 28 • Additional 55 included as other significant barriers.
- 29 • 289 (59%) are dams.
- 30 • 207 (39%) are culverts.
- 31 • 38 (7%) are tide gates, fords, and other obstructions.

32  
33 Loffink discussed the priority list's potential uses:

- 34 • Database of high priority obstructions and to help get the word out.
- 35 • Planning tool for fish passage restoration efforts; an Excel database that can be  
36 sorted by highest priority site in a District.
- 37 • Assist funding agencies.
- 38 • Potential mitigation locations
- 39 • Enforcement authority (ORS 509.625) for fish passage at priority location if  
40 location on Top Ten and ODFW has 60% of funding to provide fish passage.  
41 Loffink noted this has not been done to date.

42  
43 Loffink said the Fish Passage Task Force met on February 1 and recommend approval  
44 of the Priority List to the Commission.

45



1 Commissioner Akenson said the priority list is divided by Group Rankings (see  
2 Attachment 5 – 2013 Statewide Fish Passage Priority List). Group 1 is the highest  
3 priority ranking? Loffink said the highest priority group is the “Top Ten” list. The next  
4 highest is Group 1 and Group 15 is the lowest. Commissioner Akenson said when people  
5 are looking at projects to do, mitigation or restoration, is the priority Group 1 your priority  
6 choice over another one of those groups or is anything on the list a top priority? Loffink  
7 said both. Everything on the list is our highest priorities as identified by district  
8 biologists. He said Group 1 ranks a little higher than Group 2 and on down. We want the  
9 highest priorities first.

10  
11 Commissioner Anderson referred to the group rankings and said we received this in  
12 reverse order. Seeing it in forward order she wondered if the group ranking of Top Ten  
13 and then Group 1 through Group 15 might be confusing in terms of database search  
14 ability and how to identify it to potential funders. She suggested that Top Ten be Group 1  
15 and moving down from there. Loffink said that is a good point. He included the Top Ten  
16 because of the statutory enforcement authority. He suggested calling it “Group 1 – Top  
17 Ten” to avoid confusion.

18  
19 *Action: Commissioner Anderson recommended approval of the 2013 Statewide*  
20 *Fish Passage Priority List with the following amendments: renumbering starting*  
21 *with Group 1 through completion and having Group 1 actually be the Top Ten;*  
22 *and direct Department staff to work cooperatively with owners of artificial*  
23 *obstructions on the priority list to provide fish passage. Commissioner Wolley*  
24 *seconded the motion.*

25  
26 Commissioner Webber asked if it was clear enough how the group rankings would be  
27 renumbered. Legal Counsel Steve Sanders said he thought it was if the Commission  
28 was confident. Loffink said he could do that and resend it out to make sure it is clear.  
29 Commissioner Anderson said her intent is that Group 1 is the Top Ten followed by  
30 Groups 2, and 3 so there would be a successive one step on each group.

31  
32 *After an oral vote the motion carried unanimously by a vote of five.*

33  
34 **Public Testimony:** Chair Finley said for the Fish Passage Barrier Priority List there was  
35 no public testimony.

36  
37 **Exhibit G: RESTORATION AND ENHANCEMENT PROJECT APPROVALS**

38 Josie Thompson, Fish Restoration and Enhancement Program Coordinator, presented  
39 24 projects recommended by the R&E Board at their February 1 meeting. Thompson  
40 said this cycle the Board recommended funding for 15 restoration projects totaling  
41 \$228,594. The Board also recommending funding for nine enhancement projects totally  
42 nearly \$100,000. Thompson said the recommendations total for the last funding cycle of  
43 the biennium is \$327,000 with \$250,000 in matching funds. If all these projects are  
44 approved by the Commission today nearly all the estimated remaining revenue for the  
45 2011-2013 biennium will be allocated and that is in addition to our starting balance funds.

46  
47 **Public Testimony:** There was no public testimony.

1  
2       *Action: Commissioner Webber moved to approve the recommendations of the*  
3       *Fish Restoration and Enhancement Board. Commissioner Akenson seconded the*  
4       *motion and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of five.*  
5

## 6   **OTHER BUSINESS**

7   Director Elicker asked Curt Melcher to discuss current issues at the Oregon Legislature.  
8

9   Deputy Director Curt Melcher, Legislative Coordinator, discussed seven bills in the  
10 process that were introduced by Governor John Kitzhaber:

- 11       • SB 197 - wolf permit take for individual animals caught in the act of attacking.  
12        Allows producers to use lethal force without first receiving a permit from ODFW.  
13        Last piece of the Wolf Plan not adopted into law.
  - 14           ➤ Wolf informational hearing scheduled in March.
  - 15           ➤ Wolf tour scheduled for Senators in April.
- 16       • SB 198 – commercial fishing license suspensions. Only the Commission has  
17        statutory authority to suspend a commercial fishing license. Many courts still  
18        suspend commercial fishing licenses even though they do not have clear statutory  
19        authority; legislation would give authority to the courts. Also includes provision  
20        that OSP officers could write commercial fishing related citations for violations as  
21        opposed to misdemeanors.
- 22       • HB 2149 – Willamette wildlife mitigation; creates a dedicated account for ODFW  
23        to keep its Willamette Basin Stewardship funds, and to invest those funds with  
24        Oregon State Treasurer in higher yielding accounts.
- 25       • HB 2250 and HB 2251 – Landowner Preference Program. Recommendations are  
26        being rolled up into HB 2027
- 27       • HB 2252 – relating to different fees. Gives the Commission authority to issue  
28        multi-year licenses and offer a discount for multi-year license purchase. Includes  
29        provision that allows all active duty military to qualify for resident fee structure but  
30        they will not qualify for Controlled Hunt Resident Tags. Includes provisions to  
31        increase non-resident license agent fee on certain products to help small private  
32        sector license agents.
- 33       • HB 2390 – cougar agent program. The Commission appoints non-employee  
34        agents to do cougar work with hounds statewide. The 2007 legislation sunsets at  
35        the end of this year. Staff is asking that the sunset be removed to allow continued  
36        use of volunteer agents in some of our cougar and bear management work.

## 37 38   **ADJOURN**

39   Chair Mike Finley adjourned the public meeting at 3:30 p.m.